

**CITY OF MARIETTA/BLW PENSION BOARD MEETING**

**Wednesday, November 8, 2017  
9:00 AM – Fourth Floor City Hall Conference Room**

**MEETING MINUTES (UNOFFICIAL UNTIL APPROVED)**

**Members Present:** Steve Kish Rich Buss  
Yvonne Williams Bobby Moss  
Rick Steffes Patina Brown  
Bill Bruton

**Absent:** Stuart Fleming, Johnny Walker

**Ex Officio Members:** Davy Godfrey – Pension Board Secretary and Director, Human Resources & Risk Management  
Sam Lady – Pension Board Treasurer and Finance Director

**Visitors / Guests** Ian Janecek and Scott Arnwine – Gavion  
Fion Lau – Benefits Manager  
Tony Kay– AndCo Consulting  
Read Gignilliat-Elarbee Thompson  
Beth Keller – Controller/Purchasing Manager

**CALL TO ORDER:**

*Chairman Bobby Moss declared a quorum, and called the meeting to order at 9:05am.*

**MINUTES:**

**August 9, 2017, Regular Meeting**  
**August 25, 2017, Special Called Meeting**  
**October 13, 2017, Special Called Meeting**  
**October 13, 2017, Executive Session**

*A motion was made by Vice Chairman Steffes to approve the August 9, 2017, Regular Meeting minutes, and seconded by Member Brown.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: **6-0-1 (Member Williams abstained as she was not on the board during that meeting).***

*A motion was made by Member Williams to approve the August 25, 2017, Special Called Meeting minutes, the October 13, 2017, Regular Meeting minutes, and the October 13, 2017, Executive Session minutes, and seconded by Member Buss.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: **7-0-0.***

Chairman Moss made a change to the agenda, moving item 6 (Retirement applications and related business) to item 3. There were no objections from the members.

**BUSINESS:**

**Retirement Applications – Presented by Secretary Godfrey**

1. Effective 8/1/2017  
CALDWELL, KELLY D  
4022 Alternate Retirement Benefit  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 08/09/1984 to 07/31/2017, 32 years 11 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$5,607.02  
FIRE ASSISTANT CHIEF
  
2. Effective 8/1/2017  
MOORE, DOUGLAS T  
Consolidated Plan, Terminated Vested Early Retirement.  
Joint and Survivor Option 100% Pop-Up  
Employed: 2/13/95 to 5/26/2000, 04/16/2001 to 04/08/2013, 17 years 1 month  
Monthly Benefit: \$848.73  
FIRE ENGINEER MEDIC
  
3. Effective 9/1/2017  
FANN, CHARLES D  
4022, Terminated Vested Late/Delayed Retirement.  
4022 Automatic Survivor Benefit  
Employed: 7/10/1980 TO 5/25/1987, 6 years 9 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$242.70  
POLICE OFFICER
  
4. Effective 9/1/2017  
STOVALL, JAMES  
Consolidated Plan, Normal Retirement.  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 2/6/1995 to 8/31/2017, 22 years 6 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$2,222.93  
SENIOR MAINTENANCE TECHNICIAN
  
5. Effective 9/1/2017  
OTOOLE, CHRISTOPHER MARVIN  
Consolidated Plan, Unreduced Early Retirement.  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 8/24/1989 TO 8/31/2017, 28 years  
Monthly Benefit: \$4,662.68  
FIRE STATION COMMANDER
  
6. Effective 9/1/2017  
CURTIS, JAMES SLOSS  
Consolidated Plan, Early Retirement.  
Joint and Survivor Option 100% POP-UP  
Employed: 3/12/2007 TO 8/31/2017, 10 years 5 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$839.67  
BUSINESS LICENSE MANAGER

7. Effective 9/1/2017  
MESSIMER, DANNY  
4022 Alternate Retirement Benefit  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 6/19/1986 to 8/31/2017, 31 years 2 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$4,674.53  
POLICE MAJOR
8. Effective 9/1/2017  
MCGAHEE DAVID,  
4022, Terminated Vested Late/Delayed Retirement  
4022 Automatic Survivor Benefit  
Employed: 11/4/1976 to 2/6/1985, 8 years 2 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$147.80  
PRINTER
9. Effective 9/1/2017  
REECE, DAN  
Consolidated Plan, Terminated Vested Early Retirement.  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 4/2/1981 TO 4/11/1985, 9/5/1985 TO 1/30/1997, 15 years 3 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$652.22  
ELECTRICAL LINE WORKER
10. Effective 9/1/2017  
TOUCHSTON, LEWIS DAVID  
Consolidated Plan, Terminated Vested Early Retirement  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 10/29/1990 to 3/2/1999, 8 years 4 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$208.32  
ROUTE DRIVER
11. Effective 9/1/2017  
Ashe, Mark  
4022, Terminated Vested Late/Delayed Retirement  
4022 Automatic Survivor Benefit  
Employed: 01/24/1980 to 01/31/1985, 5 Years  
Monthly Benefit: \$114.67  
POLICE CORPORAL
12. Effective 10/1/2017  
FREER, MICHAEL  
Consolidated Plan, Unreduced Early Retirement.  
Joint and Survivor Option 50% Pop-Up  
Employed: 3/11/1996 TO 9/30/2017, 21 years 6 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$1,533.73  
POLICE OFFICER
13. Effective 10/1/2017  
CAMP, DARREN L  
Consolidated Plan, Unreduced Early Retirement.  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 9/28/1987 TO 9/30/17, 30 Years  
Monthly Benefit: \$2,174.28  
AUTOMOTIVE SERVICE WORKER

14. Effective 10/1/2017  
ATKINS, DENNIS KEITH  
Consolidated Plan, Terminated Vested Early Retirement.  
Joint and Survivor Option 100% Pop-Up  
Employed: 4/11/1988 TO 7/6/1990, 9/28/1998 TO 4/8/2005, 4/11/2005 to 4/22/2005  
8 years 10 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$211.46  
CUSTOMER SERVICE REP I

15. Effective 10/1/2017  
RICHARDS, GARY  
Consolidated Plan, Terminated Vested Early Retirement.  
Single Life Option  
Employed: 5/20/1991 TO 3/25/2002, 10 years 9 months  
Monthly Benefit: \$501.70  
AUTOMOTIVE MECHANIC

*A motion was made by Member Bruton to approve the retirement applications as presented, and seconded by Member Brown.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

Secretary Godfrey then presented the disability retirement second opinion report from Dr. Kelley on applicant David Jenkins stating that he could do sedentary work, but that the claimed neurological issues would have to be evaluated by a neurologist or neurological psychologist. Extensive discussion was held involving the members and Mr. Gignilliat regarding whether the neurological issues were part of the application, and also the appeals process for disability applicants.

*A motion was made by Member Kish to deny the application based on the information presented and the report of Dr. Kelley, and seconded by Member Bruton.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 5-1-1 (Member Brown abstained and Member Williams voted against). Member Williams then changed her vote to abstain. The motion still carried 5-0-2.*

Secretary Godfrey presented the update on Gwendolyn Carson's disability second opinion case. Secretary asked the Board for consideration of a disability exam at SiteMed, and a Functional Capacity Exam at Sovereign Rehabilitation.

*A motion was made by Member Buss to authorize Secretary Godfrey to send Gwendolyn Carson to SiteMed for a disability examination and later a Functional Capacity Exam, and seconded by Member Bruton.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

Secretary Godfrey presented the case of Charles Herron, a 4022 disability retiree who had been using a Ph.D. psychologist as his certifying provider, which does not meet the criteria in the plan. He had been given until October 15, 2017, to return his disability recertification paperwork. Although it was after the deadline, he submitted paperwork from a psychiatrist in time for the November meeting.

*A motion was made by Member Kish to approve the recertification, and seconded by Member Brown.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

Secretary Godfrey presented an update on the case of survivor Barbara Greene. After extensive discussion, the Board requested that Secretary Godfrey write a confirmation letter to Ms. Greene affirming that her request to hold her pension checks will be granted.

Secretary Godfrey presented the case of Gladys Hawkins, sister and survivor (on paper) of Jack Clemons. She has received six months of survivor payments, but the application has not gone in front of the Board for full approval. Secretary Godfrey indicated that he terminated service as a 3739 Plan participant, but was later awarded retirement benefits under the 4022 Plan. Additionally, Ms. Hawkins was awarded survivor benefits when the 3739 Plan only authorized benefits be paid to a spouse.

*A motion was made to deny the application by Member Bruton, and seconded by Member Brown.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

Chairman Moss dismissed Mr. Gignilliat, and thanked him for his counsel.

### **General Pension Report – Gavion, LLC**

Ian Janecek and Scott Arnwine from Gavion presented the General Pension Report for the 3rd quarter of calendar year 2017.

### **Supplemental Pension Report – AndCo Consulting**

Tony Kay presented the Supplemental Pension Report for the 3rd quarter of calendar year 2017.

### **Securities Monitoring**

Chairman Moss provided the board with the 3rd quarter 2017 securities monitoring report from Kessler Topaz indicating the status of litigation for securities related to the pension plan.

### **Participant Contribution Refunds**

Secretary Godfrey presented the Board with a list of all proposed refunds. Treasurer Lady stated that the refunds would show up on the December 7, 2017, checks, and Secretary Godfrey affirmed that he could notify the affected departments and individuals.

*A motion was made by Member Kish to approve the refund amounts with a payout date of December 7, 2017, and seconded by Member Bruton.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

Chairman Moss also directed Secretary Godfrey to bring back a draft ordinance that would fix the previous scrivener's error regarding the participation date of elected officials.

Discussion was held about employee notification of the participant contribution refund.

### **Review of JSO multipliers**

Secretary Godfrey provided the current summary of the joint and survivor option multipliers. He advised the Board that actuary Ed Koebel indicated that he could review the multipliers for a cost not to exceed \$2,500. Discussion was held regarding the multipliers and other variables, including the ROI.

*The item was tabled until the next meeting.*

*Chairman Moss asked the Board if it could suspend the rules to discuss the minimum age of 55 for the 80-point pension for those employees who begin working at age 18 or 19. A motion was made by Member Bruton to suspend the rules and amend the agenda to add the item, and seconded by Member Buss.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

Discussion was held regarding 18 or 19-year-old employees being required to work 37 or 36 years to reach the minimum age of 55 for the 80-point pension for those who were hired on or after March 18, 2008. Thirty-five years is currently the maximum allowable credited service on the plan.

**Pension Board Legal Services**

Secretary Godfrey advised the Board that the evaluation committee selected Elarbee Thompson as the primary Pension Board attorney for benefits guidance and litigation. Chairman Moss asked Beth Keller if the proposal could be accepted by the Board as the contract, and she replied in the affirmative.

*A motion was made by Member Kish to accept the proposal as the contract between the Board and Elarbee Thompson, and seconded by Member Bruton.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0.*

**FUTURE ESTABLISHED MEETINGS:**

February 14, 2018, 9:00am: Regular Meeting

**ADJOURNMENT:**

*A motion was made by Vice Chairman Steffes to adjourn the meeting, and seconded by Member Buss.*

*The motion carried by the following vote: 7-0-0. Meeting was adjourned at 11:51am.*

**CITY OF MARIETTA/BLW PENSION BOARD MEETING**

**Wednesday, November 8, 2017  
9:00 AM – Fourth Floor Conference Room**

**APPROVED THIS \_\_\_\_\_ DAY OF \_\_\_\_\_, 2018**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Bobby Moss, Pension Board Chairman

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Davy Godfrey, Pension Board Secretary