

CITY OF MARIETTA/BLW PENSION BOARD MEETING

**Wednesday, November 13, 2019
9:00 AM – Fourth Floor City Hall Conference Room**

MEETING MINUTES (UNOFFICIAL UNTIL APPROVED)

Members Present: Post 1: Bill Bruton Post 2: Joseph Goldstein
Post 3: Cheryl Richardson Post 4: Rich Buss
Post 5: Patina Brown Post 6: Bruce Bishop
Post 7: Keisha Register Post 8: Steve Kish

Absent: Post 9: Bobby Moss

Ex Officio Members: Davy Godfrey – Pension Board Secretary and Director, Human Resources & Risk Management
Sam Lady – Pension Board Treasurer and Finance Director

Visitors / Guests Ian Janecek and Scott Arnwine – CBIZ
Tony Kay and Gwelda Swilley – AndCo Consulting
Ed Koebel and Jennifer Johnson – Cavanaugh Macdonald
Read Gignilliat and Patrick Lail – Elarbee Thompson
Elizabeth Jacobs – Benefits Manager
Grace Brown – Risk Manager
Elizabeth Keller – Deputy Director of Finance
Catherine Copeland – Payroll Supervisor
Garry Thomas – Code Enforcement Manager

CALL TO ORDER:

Vice Chairman Patina Brown declared a quorum and called the meeting to order at 9:00am.

LEGAL MATTERS:

Vice Chairman Brown recognized Read Gignilliat, who advised the Board that Council denied David Jenkins’s appeal and upheld the decision of the Pension Board. He said that he had checked the docket, but nothing had been filed in the Superior Court, and there is a 30-day requirement for certiorari. Gignilliat also provided a pension forfeiture update on Shantel Bowens and Debbie Bailey. He advised the Board that both petitions filed by the City were successful in the Superior Court, and the Office of State Administrative Hearings has set hearings for both cases on January 8, 2020. He said that it’s fairly short notice considering the distance of the witnesses, but that they were ready to go for dial-in testimony. He also said that he and Secretary Godfrey would serve as primary witnesses in the hearing for the dollar amounts discussed, which may end up being over \$500,000 each. Vice Chairman Brown recognized Patrick Lail, who then advised the Board that Charles Herron has submitted information to the Board that he has not been seen by a physician as required but has submitted a request for normal retirement conversion. Patrick advised the Board that no action was required by the Board except to process it in due course. Secretary Godfrey advised that Mr. Herron is aware that there will be a slight recoupment based on the difference in amounts between normal and disability.

Vice Chairman Brown asked to move the review of the acquisition/name change document from item number 6 to item number 2 and considered going into executive session. Member Goldstein inquired as

to the reason for executive session. Lail said it should be acceptable to go into executive session to receive legal advice. Gignilliat clarified, stating that since it was a purchasing-related document, that didn't fall into executive session matters. Discussion was held regarding executive session to discuss medical information related to the disability retirement. Member Richardson asked the Vice Chairman to go into recess for five minutes. Recess was called for five minutes at 9:17. Vice Chairman Brown called the meeting into order at 9:22 with a decision to not go into executive session for either issue. The name change item remained where it is in the agenda.

DISABILITY RETIREMENT APPLICATION OF RUSSELL CHAMBERS:

Patrick Lail introduced the disability retirement application of Russell Chambers and gave the board some facts related to his application. Secretary Godfrey related to the board that Mr. Chambers has requested a February 1 retirement date if approved due to FMLA reasons. Member Buss asked about holding a special called meeting to review the application before February 1. Gignilliat stated that a conditional approval would still require a termination of benefits hearing. Vice Chairman Brown asked the members for availability in mid-January. After some discussion, the board settled with January 15 at 9:00am in the 4th Floor Conference Room. She asked for a motion in this regard.

A motion was made by Member Bishop to set a special called meeting on January 15, 2020, at 9:00am. Motion seconded by Member Bruton.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0

PENSION VALUATION REPORT:

Vice Chairman Brown dismissed the legal counsel at 9:30 and introduced the July 1, 2019, Pension Valuation Report. Ed Koebel, actuary from Cavanaugh Macdonald, provided the board with the report and gave a presentation.

GENERAL PENSION REPORT – CBIZ (formerly Gavion, LLC):

Vice Chairman Brown recognized Ian Janecek and Scott Arnwine from CBIZ, who presented the General Pension Report for the 3rd quarter of calendar year 2019. They also had an executive summary through October that they presented. Janecek presented the securities litigation claims status report based on information he'd received from SunTrust. Member Richardson expressed concern that this could be considered legal advice. Secretary Godfrey stated that he'd inquired to KTMC regarding their costs of submitting claims and he'd provide the board with that information at the next meeting. Discussion was held regarding the name change to CBIZ based on an acquisition and what would need to be done. The name change document was provided to the board. Upon inquiry, Tony Kay from AndCo stated that there was only a name change from Bogdahn to AndCo, and Janecek stated that Gavion was indeed bought out by CBIZ. The consensus was that the board could approve the name change for now and then go out to RFP if needed.

A motion was made by Member Buss to approve the name change document from Gavion to CBIZ. Motion seconded by Member Goldstein.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0

SUPPLEMENTAL PENSION REPORT – AndCo Consulting:

Vice Chairman recognized Tony Kay from AndCo Consulting, who presented the Supplemental Pension Report for the 3rd quarter of calendar year 2019.

MINUTES:

August 14, 2019, Regular Meeting

A motion was made by Member Kish to approve the minutes from the August 14, 2019, Regular Meeting and seconded by Member Register.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0.

PENSION EDUCATION UPDATE:

Secretary Godfrey provided the board with a pension education update. Member Lady had a question regarding the requirements. Extensive discussion was held regarding the wording of the ordinance and the wording of state law. Member Richardson stated that she thought Member Lady was exempt. The board's consensus was to check with the attorney to determine who exactly needs to complete the education. Secretary Godfrey stated that he'd communicated with Lail prior to the meeting, and that Lail said that he'd leave it up to the board to decide who needs to go. Member Lady stated that someone told him that his staff would need to go. Secretary Godfrey stated for the record that there was a discussion about how the part of the code or law could be interpreted, but that at no time had he provided guidance that any staff members would be required to attend training or receive education. Secretary Godfrey related to the board that "trustee" is mentioned in the state law, and that the attorneys drafted up city code to help define that for the board—hence the language that is used.

RETIREMENT APPLICATIONS – Secretary Godfrey:

1. Ross David Routh II - Effective 08/01/2019
Consolidated – Early
100% Joint & Survivor w/Pop Up
Employed: 08/06/2001 – 07/31/2019
Total Credited Service: 17 years, 11 months
Monthly Benefit: \$732.71
Prisoner Transport Officer
2. Deanna Kirby – Effective 08/01/2019
Consolidated - Survivor
Monthly Benefit: \$1,084.25
Survivor of Douglas Kirby
3. Christopher Copeland – Effective 08/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
Single Life Option
Employed: 08/01/1994 – 07/31/2019
Total Credited Service: 25 years
Monthly Benefit: \$2,010.59
Equipment Operator I
4. Mark Proctor – Effective 08/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
Single Life Option
Employed: 09/13/1979 – 07/29/1983 & 06/20/2005 – 07/31/2019
Total Credit Service: 17 years, 10 months
Monthly Benefit: \$1,755.69
SR Inspector Bldg Trades I

5. Merv McDonald – Effective 09/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
Single Life Option
Employed: 11/04/1990 – 08/31/2019
Total Credited Service: 28 years, 9 months
Monthly Benefit: \$5,204.08
Fire Station Commander
6. David Collins – Effective 09/01/2019
Consolidated - Normal
50% Joint & Survivor with Pop Up
Employed: 05/15/2006 – 08/31/2019
Total Credited Service: 13 years, 3 months
Monthly Benefit: \$1,060.45
Plans Examiner I
7. Mary A Evans – Effective 09/01/2019
Consolidated - Normal
Single Life Benefit
Employed: 08/23/1999 – 08/31/2019
Total Credited Service: 20 years
Monthly Benefit: \$1,094.75
Receptionist
8. Donnie Lyle – Effective 09/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
Single Life Benefit
Employed: 08/17/1989 – 08/31/2019
Total Credited Service: 30 years
Monthly Benefit: \$3,564.64
Supervisor Streets
9. Scott Everingham – Effective 10/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
Single Life Benefit
Employed: 04/19/1995 – 09/30/2019
Total Credited Service: 24 years, 5 months
Monthly Benefit: \$3,548.86
Internal Auditor
10. Nicole Curl – Effective 10/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
Single Life Benefit
Employed: 08/07/1990 – 09/30/2019
Total Credited Service: 29 years, 1 month
Monthly Benefit: \$3,381.95
Risk Manager
11. Patrick Johnson – Effective 10/01/2019
Consolidated – Unreduced Early
75% Joint & Survivor w/Pop Up
Employed: 12/19/1989 – 09/30/2019
Total Credited Service: 29 years, 9 months
Monthly Benefit: \$2,464.48
Inspector Water & Sewer

12. Robert Wells – Effective 10/01/2019
Consolidated – Terminated Vested
Single Life Benefit
Employed: 9/01/1983 – 08/01/1996
Total Credited Service: 12 years, 11 months
Monthly Benefit: \$468.08
Electrical Line Worker

A motion was made by Member Kish to approve the retirement applications and seconded by Member Register.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0.

A motion was made by Member Goldstein to approve retirement applications 1-11 and seconded by Member Richardson.

A motion was made by Member Goldstein to amend his previous motion to approve applications 1-11 and approve number 12 with the change to the employment date of 9/1/1983 and seconded by Member Richardson.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0.

A motion was made by Member Goldstein to approve retirement applications 1-11 and approve number 12 with the change to the employment date of 9/1/1983 and seconded by Member Richardson.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0.

PENSION VERIFICATION FORM UPDATE – Secretary Godfrey:

Secretary Godfrey advised the board that there are two outstanding pension verification forms where there has been no contact: Vivian Blount and Melvin Jackson. Member Lady recommended that if benefits are suspended, make the date January 1. After some discussion, he changed the recommendation to the February 1 payment.

A motion was made by Member Goldstein to suspend benefits for the two outstanding individuals, Melvin Jackson and Vivian Blount, effective with the February pension payments unless the city establishes contact prior to January 20 and seconded by Member Richardson.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0.

4022 COLA Update

Secretary Godfrey provided the board with the history of the COLA percentages since the plan's inception in 1984 and discussed that there are three active employees still on the plan. He stated that the COLAs for 2019 went out smoothly with the October 1 pension payment at 1.7%.

NEW BUSINESS:

Secretary Godfrey provided an election update. He deferred to Member Kish for an update on the police election. Secretary Godfrey stated that the general employee election opened on the 8th. Regarding the 2020 GAPPT membership, CPPT fees, and events authorization, Secretary Godfrey stated that the board had indicated a preference to authorize the entire year's expenses at the November meeting.

A motion was made by Member Bruton to approve the 2020 expenses, including certification and membership and seconded by Member Buss.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0.

FUTURE ESTABLISHED MEETINGS:

January 15, 2020, 9:00am: Special Called Meeting

February 12, 2020, 9:00am: Regular Meeting

ADJOURNMENT:

A motion was made by Member Goldstein to adjourn the meeting and seconded by Member Bishop.

The motion carried by the following vote: 8-0-0. Meeting was adjourned at 11:48am.

CITY OF MARIETTA/BLW PENSION BOARD MEETING

**Wednesday, November 13, 2019
9:00 AM – Fourth Floor Conference Room**

APPROVED THIS _____ DAY OF _____, 2020

Bobby Moss, Pension Board Chairman

ATTEST:

Davy Godfrey, Pension Board Secretary